

~~South~~
Edgewater-Gatchouses ~~(A and B)~~
Station Road
Barrytown Vicinity
Dutchess County
New York

HABS No. NY-5621-A ~~and B~~

HABS,
NY,
14-BARTO.V,
1A -

PHOTOGRAPH

HISTORICAL AND DESCRIPTIVE DATA

Historic American Buildings Survey
National Park Service
Department of the Interior
Washington, D. C. 20240

HISTORIC AMERICAN BUILDINGS SURVEY

EDGEWATER GATEHOUSES

Location: Station Road, Barrytown Vicinity
Dutchess County, New York

Present Owners
and Occupants: South gatehouse: Margaret Gummere
North gatehouse: Virginia Scott

Present Use: Residences

Significance: The Edgewater gatehouses, designed by architect Alexander Jackson Davis in 1854 for Robert Donaldson, gave an axis of approach to Edgewater. Both octagon-fronted cottages, originally identical in size and shape, were finished in different styles; one was Italianate and the other Oriental.

PART I. HISTORICAL INFORMATION

A. Physical History:

1. Date of erection: Robert Donaldson purchased Edgewater from Margaret Livingston Brown in 1852, and later commissioned A. J. Davis to add a library and conservatory to the main house as well as design the two gatehouses which were erected in 1854.
2. Architect: Alexander Jackson Davis (1803-1892) began work on the gatehouses in 1853 and finished in July 1854. (Day Book of A. J. Davis, New York Public Library, New York, New York and Day Book of A. J. Davis, Print Department, Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, New York)
3. Original and subsequent owners: Both gatehouses remained part of Edgewater's property until 1872. Chains of title for each gatehouse follow:

South gatehouse

1872 Will recorded July 5, 1872, in
Book 1 page 620
Will of Robert Donaldson (contested by children)

1902 Deed recorded September 17, 1902, in
Liber 322 page 142
Robert Bronson, executor of estate of Eliza Donaldson
to
Elizabeth W. Chapman for \$20,000

- 1934 Deed recorded December 29, 1934, in
Liber 542 page 367
Elizabeth W. Chapman
to
Chanler A. Chapman for \$15 South Carolina tax stamp
- 1951 Deed recorded January 25, 1951, in
Liber 766 page 110
Chanler A. Chapman
to
Margaret M. Gummere for \$10,000 for both gatehouses

North gatehouse

- 1875 Deed recorded October 28, 1875, in
Liber 181 page 159
William G., Eliza and Isabella Donaldson
to
Ellen Flyn for \$1200 (North gatehouse only)
- 1903 Deed recorded September 1, 1903, in
Liber 328 page 313
Ellen Flyn
to
Julia D. Stone for \$600
- 1922 Deed recorded August 7, 1922, in
Liber 426 page 53
Julia D. Stone
to
John C. Stone for about \$450
- 1928 Deed recorded July 20, 1928, in
Liber 487 page 331
John C. Stone
to
Lorenzo H. Armstrong for \$1.00 (without tax stamp)
- 1934 Deed recorded October 5, 1928, in
Liber 490 page 4
Lorenzo H. Armstrong
to
Elizabeth Chapman for \$1.00 (without tax stamp)
- 1934 Deed recorded December 29, 1934, in
Liber 542 page 367
Elizabeth W. Chapman
to
Chanler A. Chapman for \$15 South Carolina stamp

1951 Deed recorded January 25, 1951, in
Liber 766 page 110
Chanler A. Chapman
to
Margaret M. Gummere for \$10,000 for both gatehouses

1963 Deed recorded June 17, 1963
Liber 1103 page 50
Margaret M. Gummere
to
Virginia Scott for \$7,500 for north gatehouse only

4. Original plan and construction: A. J. Downing wrote that a gatehouse should give a hint of what will be seen at the main house without competing architecturally. Downing's approach apparently influenced Davis' choice of octagon-fronted gatehouses placed in an octagonal turnaround, echoing the part of Edgewater first visible from the approach, the octagonal library addition. The cottages were exactly alike in configuration, but different in style and detail.

The north gatehouse was Oriental or East Indian in style and closely resembles a "Villa in Oriental Style" from Davis' Rural Residences. The board and batten gatehouse is smaller and simpler, yet the treatment of the roof, veranda ornament and the pagoda-like form is similar stylistically. The window labels suggest a Gothic vocabulary but the Oriental character dominates the composition.

Davis preferred calling the south gatehouse in the Italianate style, Etruscan. A beautifully arcaded porch originally was stuccoed, then scored and painted to imitate stone. The treatment of details and proportions gave this small cottage a surprising monumentality that contrasts with the lighter, more fanciful Oriental gatehouse.

Although no Davis drawings of the gatehouse can be located, their attribution is unquestioned. Moreover, stylistic evidence coupled with Davis' long association with Donaldson supports Davis' authorship. In November 1853, (Day Book II of A. J. Davis, Avery Library) Davis noted that he made plans for a gatehouse; mansion; cottages one, two, and three; and the Sunday School Chapel. Later, he wrote that he designed a library, greenhouse, schoolhouse and gardener's cottage. The chapel, schoolhouse, cottages, additions to the main house and gatehouses appear on an 1858 map; thus it seems that the second gatehouse may have been called by another name.

5. Additions and alterations: Both gatehouses have been enlarged, the north more radically than the south. A two story rear wing was added as well as a small two frame house on the north ca. 1900. A window was installed on the second floor over the main doorway.

The south gatehouse has had a one story rear addition which is not visible from the road.

The octagonal turnaround shown in the 1858 map has been destroyed.

PART II. SOURCES OF INFORMATION

A. Original architectural drawings:

1. Sketch by Robert Donaldson in a letter to A. J. Davis, 13 March 1854, A. J. Davis Collection, Avery Library, Columbia University, New York, New York.
2. Drawing by A. J. Davis of the Edgewater Chapel, A. J. Davis Collection, New York Historical Society, New York, New York.

B. Old map of Edgewater, Property of R. Donaldson, 1858, Barrytown, New York, by Henry B. Myers, Surveyor.

C. Old views:

1. Photographs of the library, east elevation, east elevation with springhouse, view of road entrance, west elevation, and boathouse in the A. J. Davis Collection, Print Department, Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, New York.
2. Photographs in the collection of Richard Jenrette, Barrytown, New York.

D. Bibliography:

1. Primary and unpublished sources:

A. J. Davis Collections at the Avery Library, Columbia University; New York Historical Society, Metropolitan Museum of Art; all located in New York, New York.

Deed Books, Dutchess County Courthouse, Poughkeepsie, New York

Interviews with Jane B. Davies in July 1974 in New York City and Rhinebeck, New York. Mrs. Davis, historian and noted authority on A. J. Davis, generously shared her notes about Edgewater.

2. Secondary sources:

- Davies, Jane. "We Can't Get On Without You," Columbia Library Columns, Vol. 16, New York: Nov. 1966. pp. 12-24.
- Dutchess County Planning Board, Landmarks of Dutchess County, 1683-1867, New York: 1969. pp. 146-147.
- Eberlein, Harold Donaldson, and Cortland Van Dyke Hubbard, Historic Houses of the Hudson Valley. New York: 1942. pp. 90, 93, plate 82.
- Reed, John. The Hudson River. New York: 1960. pp. 109, 174.
- Reif, Rita. "A Man and His Homes," New York Times, April 4, 1971 p. 10.
- Schauinger, J. Herman. William Gaston, Carolinian. Milwaukee: 1949.
- Smith, James H. History of Dutchess County. New York: 1882. p. 188.
- Valentine's Manual of Old New York 1924. "Scene at Barrytown as it appeared in 1845." New York: 1924.

Written by Susanne Brendel
Columbia University, 1974

Edited by Susan Stein, 1981
Architectural Historian

PART III. PROJECT INFORMATION

This project was sponsored jointly by the National Park Service and the Dutchess County Landmarks Association, with a grant from the New York State Council on the Arts and further assistance from the IBM Mid-Hudson Valley, the Richard Hampton Jenrette Foundation, the Rhinebeck Historical Society and Private Donors; measured and drawn during the Summer of 1974, under the direction of John Poppeliers, Chief of HABS, by Richard Crowley (Architect, Rhinebeck), Project Supervisor, with Susanne Brendel (Columbia University), Historian, and Randy Abramson (Washington University), Robert Ferland (Cornell University), Thomas Fisher (Cornell University), and Stanley Tang (University of Pennsylvania), Student Assistant Architects, at Rhinebeck, New York. The historical and descriptive data was edited in 1981 for HABS by Architectural Historian Susan Stein. Final preparation of the documentation was carried out in the HABS Washington Office by Paul Dolinsky, HABS Architect, and Lucy Pope Wheeler, HABS Writer/Editor.